THE UNIVERSITY OF
WARWICK

THE WARWICK COMMISSION

THE
FUTURE
OF
CULTURAL
VALUE

# Education & training

**Eleonora Belfiore,
Natalie Hart
& Jonothan Neelands**

**University of Warwick**

# EDUCATION & TRAINING

## Introduction

When the Warwick Commission on the Future of Cultural Value was first planned, it encompassed four strands of inquiry: Investment, Value, Education and International perspectives. Over the life of the Commission it has become increasingly obvious that the Education strand is perhaps the most critical and complex. It is likely that recommendations relating to the other three strands will to some extent be dependent on the recommendations relating to education. One strength of the Commission is that we have a specialist group of Commissioners focussed on this strand all of whom are experienced in producing high impact policy reports and reviews in the domains of arts, culture, creativity and education.

## Six key points for discussion

Given the Commission's focus on the future flourishing of the creative and cultural ecosystem, education has the potential to address a number of the Commission's key concerns. In brief:

1. The evidence suggests that, whilst overall cultural participation levels are going up, there is a lack of public support for the subsidised Arts in particular: a survey run by You Gov in 2013 revealed that only 28% of general public respondents believed that arts funding should remain a priority in times of austerity (Kowalewski, 2013)[1].

   A recent analysis of Taking Part data suggests that only 8% of adults in England can be classified as 'highly engaged' with publicly funded arts events, participation in the arts, visits to museums, galleries and heritage sites, reading and volunteering in the cultural sector. This group is characterised by high levels of income, education and is relatively white in origin[2]. There is an urgent need to address the significant levels of public disengagement from the Arts. Education in its broadest sense is the most important opportunity we have to give the young access to and understanding of a wide range of arts experiences and to begin to address these disconnections between the public and those sub-sectors of the creative and cultural industries which depend on levels of public subsidy[3].

   Our argument is that if there can be sufficient public support for the Arts, the problems of pressing the Treasury to maintain levels of subsidy[4] would be a less challenging task. Without a sufficient level of public support, the Arts are vulnerable to reduced levels of subsidy. As we have shown elsewhere reduced levels of subsidy to the Arts will have significant causal effects on the economic success of the Creative and Cultural Industries (see Appendix 1), the UK's international standing[5] and on the well-being[6] of the UK. The problems of disengagement may in fact supersede the problems of measuring value through economic and other proxies.

2. The increasing significance of the Creative and Cultural Industries to the UK's economy[7] requires that all young people are given educational and cultural opportunities that: develop their creativity and entrepreneurial ability in general; embrace the digital revolution in the production and dissemination of cultural and creative practices and products; ensures that there is access and excellence for all in regard to creative and

cultural learning[8].

There is evidence to suggest that an excellent cultural and creative education is not universally available, rather it is at best patchy and at worst restricted to children who benefit from independent schooling and a home education that includes frequent access to creative and cultural experiences[9] (Department for Education, 2011, p7-8; Henley, 2011, p32-37; Ewing, 2010; President's Committee on the Arts and the Humanities, 2011; Lord *et al.*, 2012, p5).

The Commission is also waiting to receive evidence that the introduction of students fees and other economic constraints and considerations are impacting on the diversity of applications to Arts and Humanities courses at HE level[10]. Given that the Creative and Cultural Industries have a very high level of graduate[11] employment this trend may impact on diversity of the workforce.

3. In addition to ensuring that all young people are given the choice of the Arts in their lives and are given a generic creative educational offer, education also needs to ensure that there is diversity in the talent pipeline on which the future success of the Creative and Cultural Industries depend.

   For reasons which are difficult to determine the UK has, historically, produced exceptionally talented artists and creators as well as exceptionally creative entrepreneurs, engineers and scientists (Henley in Department for Education, 2013, p3). However, there is evidence to suggest that the talent pipeline which feeds both the Arts and creative careers more generally is becoming less representative of the UK population and is increasingly dominated by a narrow demographic (see Appendix 2).

   The growing inequalities in the distribution of wealth in the UK[12] are also now reflected in the distribution of the cultural resources needed to ensure equity and excellence in the talent pipeline. It is important to recognise that the need for the public education system to develop creative and cultural potential and acumen is not just a social justice and human development issue. It is also an economic imperative – to be really successful the Creative and Cultural Industries require diversity and an inclusive workforce (Panayiotu in Appignanesi, , p2; Jancovich, 2011, p279; Newbigin, 2011, p234)[13].

4. There is considerable public support for an education offer that provides the young with arts experiences and the opportunities to develop their creative and cultural talents. For instance a You Gov survey of the general public, claimed that 40% of respondents said that the top priority for arts funding allocation should be 'developing talent' and 24% 'helping arts education'[14]. There are publically funded mechanisms in place and organisations designed to support the arts in the curriculum and as extra-curricular opportunities for all including talent development (see Appendix 4). But there are worrying gaps and disconnects in this provision and the Commission is considering how we might achieve a more consistent, coherent, integrated and accessible creative and cultural offer to the young. The Arts are part of a curriculum entitlement for all children (Vaizey and Gove in Department for Education, 2013, p3), but without additional specialised tuition and training the talented artists of the future will not develop to the

levels required for successful careers[15]. The costs of conservatoire levels of training are considerable and without subsidy beyond the reach of many aspiring to this level of training (see Appendix 5). The Commission is concerned to monitor how proposed changes in HEFCE funding structures and to the publically supported bursaries, scholarships and other award which will be decided in 2015 might impact on the diversity of artists and other creatives in training[16].

In particular, the Commission is concerned that many parents and carers are confused by what's on offer, how to access it at an appropriate level, what progression means and how best to help the young to develop the skills and experiences needed for successful careers in the Creative and Cultural Industries (Ipsos MORI, 2009, p8). We think that more can be done to make the cultural and creative offer out of school more transparent, affordable and accessible[17].

5.  The Commission is also interested in identifying the qualities of School and Cultural Leadership needed to progress the creative and cultural education agendas. There are exceptional school leaders both in the public and independent schools who do provide high quality and comprehensive creative and culturally rich education. This is often in the belief that the arts and creativity are essential to the idea of a fully rounded and 'cultured' individual. There are exceptional cultural leaders who put education at the very core of their organisations and who understand that cultural organisations bear a responsibility for creating the future demand for the arts and culture and for supporting the identification and nurturing of talent (see Appendix 6). The Commission wants to consider how leadership training in both domains might make high quality creative and cultural engagement for the young the rule rather than the exception.

6.  What happens once creative talent completes formal education is also important. We think post-education pathways into the industries should also be something for the Commission to reflect upon.  In particular, the questions of internships and informal recruiting practices are particularly important areas for concern. There is now a substantial body of research evidence, produced both within academia and by cultural sector's bodies and skill councils that highlights a number of issues with internships, and with the current conditions of creative labour more generally (cfr. Oakley 2011; Allen at al. 2012)[18].

Both Creative & Cultural Skills and Creative Skillset have drawn attention, in their submitted evidence, to the challenges that creative talent face in entering the cultural professions. The problems highlighted focus on the widespread reliance on unpaid internship as informal entry points in the sector, and therefore the importance of social and professional networks, and low pay[19]. This, combined with the high educational standards expected of cultural workers, has constrained diversity in the sector in relation to gender, disability and ethnicity. These features of the creative labour market are also likely to have had negative impact on social mobility in the creative industries. This is however an area where an evidence gap exists, as indeed remarked by Creative & Cultural Skills and Creative Skillset, who identify this as a key area for future data gathering and analysis[20].

## Endnotes

1 http://yougov.co.uk/news/2013/06/14/opinion-formers-and-public-split-arts-funding/

2  This is as of yet unpublished data produced by the AHRC funded project 'Understanding Everyday Participation – Articulating Cultural Values' that was presented in April 2014 as evidence to the Warwick Commission on its second commissioner working day). This new research insight confirms findings of previous, similar studies: "All the participation and attendance surveys already cited agree that class, education and profession are combined, clear predictors of engagements with the arts. The better educated, wealthy, and those employed in managerial or professional jobs are the most regular and frequent arts attenders" (Belfiore & Bennett, 2007, p253). This is an issue we have also covered in the first of the Commission briefing documents (http://www2.warwick.ac.uk/research/warwickcommission/futureculture/resources/researc h/commission/cd1_brief_-_pub.pdf).

3 Darren Henley states in his review on cultural education in England, "Schools remain the single most important place where children learn about Cultural Education" (Henley, 2012, p8).   This statement is echoed by the DfE, "Most children will have their first experience of music at school" (Department for Education, 2011, p3). This is particularly the case for children whose parents have no qualifications and those who are eligible for free school meals (Bunting, 2013, p13).  This makes the role of schools and importantly Local Authorities who make funding decisions, crucial in enabling young people to access culture (Henley, 2012, p8)

4 Following two reports Baroness Andrews, K. (2014) *Culture and Poverty: Harnessing the power of the arts, culture and heritage to promote social justice in Wales*  and Smith, D. (2013) *An independent report for the Welsh Government into Arts in Education in the Schools of Wales* , the Welsh government announced on May 27th 2014 at the Hay Festival that the government will boost Arts Education Funding by £20 million over the next 5 years (http://www.walesonline.co.uk/news/wales-news/hay-festival-20m-action-plan-7179084)

The Australian Government have just released a report on the role of arts participation in Australian life which found that "Australians increasingly see the arts as important and relevant

to their lives. 85 percent say that the arts make for a richer and more meaningful life, an increase of 5 percentage points since 2009 and 14 points since 1999" (Australia Council, 2014, p10)

http://www.australiacouncil.gov.au/resources/reports_and_publications/subjects/audiences_and_cultural_participation/arts-participation

[5] See Creative Skillset Brief p2

[6] Evidence shows that participation in arts and culture increases empathy and tolerance (Nussbaum, 2010, p143; Leroux & Bernadska, 2014), contributes to a fulfilling life (White, 2007; Anderson et al., 2009; Winston, 2006) encourages civic participation, including voting (Leroux & Bernadska, 2014), enhances academic achievement, cognitive and transferable skills across the spectrum but particularly those from low income backgrounds (Fiske, 1999; Tripney et al., 2010, p6; Forgeard *et al.*, 2008; Moreno *et al.*, 2011; Schellenberg, 2006; Rauscher & Zuppan, 2000; Shook *et al.*, 2013), enhances health and wellbeing (Bamford, 2006) and improves the Lisbon Key Competencies (see Appendix 3). A life-long engagement with culture both sustains the sector and enhances the social and economic wellbeing of a country (Jowell, 2004, p15; Smith, 2013, p3). Cultural education introduces people to art forms both as creative producers and consumers (Jowell, 2004). The role of parents in igniting a love of culture in children is also extremely important and thus investment in cultural education has the potential to echo down the generations (Bunting, 2013, p8).

[7] As a proportion of GDP, the UK has the largest creative industries sector in the world – contributing between 6%-8% of our nation's output (Nathan, 2011, p1). They contribute £71.4 billion per year to the UK economy (a growth of 9.4% since 2011) and employ 2.55 million people (see Creative Skillset Brief page 1 and NESTA, A manifesto for the Creative Economy, 2013). Economic projections drawn up in 2010 suggested that with proactive investment in skills, training and R&D, the GVA contributed by the sector to the UK economy could grow by as much as 31% between 2010 and 2020 (Creative & Cultural Skills, Creative and Cultural Industry: Occupational, Skills and Productivity Forecasting, 2011).

[8] Under the premise that the Pacific regions will be the global leaders of the future, the IPPR report *Oceans of innovation: The Atlantic, the Pacific, global leadership and the future of*

*education* explored the education systems of this area.  The research posed questions about the type of leadership that will be needed to tackle the global problems that we face as we progress through the 21st Century.  The answers that they offer stress the significance of innovation and point to education as being the key to ensuring that this innovation is fostered (Barber *et al.*, 2012, p1).  One of the key components of innovation is critical thinking and the Programme for International Student Assessment (PISA) research on student's problem solving skills showed that, although lagging behind the Pacific countries, students from the UK were reasonably adept in this area. Highlighting the increased need for these proficiencies in the workplaces of the future, the research noted that, "Problem-solving skills are best developed within meaningful contexts" (OECD, 2014, p121).  The arts provides ample opportunities to provide these meaningful contexts, as the report's examples demonstrates: "[When participating in the] Visual arts [...] students are taught to envision what they cannot observe directly with their eyes, to observe carefully, to reflect on their work process and product, to engage and persist in their efforts, and to stretch and explore creative possibilities"(OECD, 2014, p122). The success in problem solving skills that students from the Pacific countries demonstrated could be attributed to recent investment by their governments in arts education as a means of developing innovation and creativity.   See Creative and Cultural Skills Brief Section 2 and Creative Skillset Brief p2


[9] The Roberts (2006) report for the government, *Nurturing Creativity*, identified that entry and progression routes in the creative industries lacked clarity and transparency, which prevented them from achieving a representative work force.  Roberts proposed a number of ways to rectify the situation including: careers advice, a new qualification route, work-based training, education-business partnerships, mentoring networks and demand-led skills provision.


The average cost of music lessons in maintained schools in 2009 was £123 p.a. and only 8% of pupils in maintained schools were learning an instrument.   In 2011 the government promised to nurture music education and ensure that any child from any background should be able to access musical training (Department for Education, 2011, p3).  However, Music Hubs have been introduced at a time of Local Authority Budget Cuts and the funding for them has been reduced from £82m in 2010-11 down to £58m in 2014-15 (Bowen, 2014). The concern is that if young people are not getting access to music tuition at beginner level then they will not be able to progress through the talent pipeline (Bowen, 2014).  It is not just music that poses a potential cost barrier, as research has shown that "Some subjects, especially 'creative subjects' (art, design and technology, photography) require extra materials and therefore cost more to study.

27 % of students on free school meals (FSM); 14 % of low-income students; and 8 % of better-off students chose not to study arts or music due to the associated costs." (Farthing, 2013, p4-5)

*Note: Music Hubs were established in August 2012, they are managed by Arts Council England on behalf of DfE and are a collection of organisations working in a local area, to create joined up music education provision for children and young people, both in and out of school*

[10] Across subjects there is a link between University entrance and economic background.  Only 14% of pupils who are eligible for free school meals participate in higher education at age 19/20, compared with 33% of pupils who are not eligible for free school meals.  Findings suggest that this socio-economic gap in university participation does not emerge at the point of entry into higher education.  Rather, it comes about because poorer pupils do not achieve as highly in secondary school as their more advantaged counterparts, confirming the general trend in the literature that socioeconomic gaps emerge relatively early in individuals' lives (Chowdry *et al.*, 2009).  In 2013 the gap between advantaged and disadvantaged areas remained large with 47% of 18 year olds from the most advantaged areas attending university, compared to 17% from the mostdisadvantaged.  However there is evidence that this gap is at least narrowing: UCAS reports that 18 year-olds in England from disadvantaged areas were around 9 % more likely to be accepted for entry to higher education in the UK in the 2013 application cycle than they were in 2012. This increase is greater than the 3 % for 18 year-olds from advantaged areas (HEFCE, 2013, p8).  The recent report *Studying Craft: trends in craft education and training* states that although the number of courses offered in craft related design and technology has on the whole increased, take up of these GCSE's fell by 19% between 2007/8 and 2010/11 and at FE level fell by 58%  (Pomegranate & TBR, 2014, p5).  Part of this could be explained by the governments drive to involve employers in the curriculum development which is more complicated for Craft as 88% of the sector is made up of sole traders or microbusinesses.  At HE level there has been a 38% decline in courses offered with ceramics and glass being particularly effected (Pomegranate & TBR, 2014, p5).  UCAS data on acceptance on to full time drama courses showed that whilst 24.4% were from POLAR5 (the most affluent postcodes) only 15% were from POLAR1 (the least affluent postcodes.)   See Creative Skillset Brief p4 for a breakdown of Key Statistics in Higher Education, Further Education and Apprenticeships

[11] The qualification level of those entering the sector is higher than average: at present, the proportion of workers in the sector qualified to level 4 or above is 59% , a figure which is set to rise to 67% by 2020 (Creative and Cultural Skills Council, Impact and Footprint, 2012) also see Creative and Cultural Skills Brief section 3

[12] The report *State of the nation 2013: social mobility and child poverty in Great Britain* produced by the Social mobility and child poverty commission stated that Britain still remains deeply divided with disadvantage strongly shaping life chances and a prediction that the situation is set to worsen rather than improve. It found that class is a bigger barrier to getting a job 'at the top' than gender (p4-5). See also http://www.resolutionfoundation.org/media/media/downloads/Squeezed_Britain.pdf and http://www.theguardian.com/society/2013/feb/10/uk-super-rich-richer-as-majority-squeezed

[13] Also see Creative Skillset Brief p3

[14] See page 3 http://d25d2506sfb94s.cloudfront.net/cumulus_uploads/document/dtkpekc8np/YouGov-Reputation-Survey-Results-Arts-Funding-General-public-130529.pdf

[15] The government have expressed a commitment to investing £292 million of funding into high-quality cultural education from 2013-2015 with the statement that, "Young people with exceptional talent, irrespective of background, deserve exceptional programmes to support them. We are ensuring that new and extended programmes in music, art and design, dance, drama and film are available."(Department for Education, 2013, p8). On April 9th 2014 Michael Gove announced changes to GCSE and A-Level arts subjects, stating that art, design, music, drama and dance will be "reformed as rigorous, demanding and world-class new GCSEs and A levels for first teaching from September 2016". The subjects will now be counted towards the new secondary accountability measure, which is based on a pupil's progress in 8 subjects - English and maths; 3 EBacc subjects; and 3 other subjects (which can be EBacc subjects, but which can also be these new GCSEs, or high-quality vocational qualifications). It will also mean that dance and drama will no longer be grouped as one subject. The government states that "The increase in the number of subjects that count in performance tables (from 5 to 8) will encourage more schools to ensure more students do well in the arts". This reform could turn

around the recent decline in students taking arts subjects which has been attributed to their absence from the EBacc subjects:

- ➲ There has been a 14% drop in arts GCSE's being studied (Cultural Learning Alliance, 2013).
- ➲ A 2012 Ipsos MORI report found that 27% of schools had withdrawn a subject because of the EBacc with the subject most likely to be withdrawn being a performing arts subject at 23%. 17% had withdrawn art, 14% design/design technology and 11% had withdrawn textiles (Greevy *et al.*, 2012, p37).
- ➲ Even pre-EBacc there has been a decline in students taking arts subject -28% between 2003 and 2013 (Cultural Learning Alliance, 2013)

See Creative and Cultural Skills Brief section 1 for information on skills shortage in the creative industry. See Cultural Learning Alliance Brief for the disincentives at work on the provision of cultural learning and the impact they are having and their suggestions for STEAM rich schools.

[16] In February 2014 the government announced a reduction in the teaching budget in 2014/15 and further reductions in 2015/16. They stipulated that savings should be delivered in ways that protect as far as possible high cost subjects (including STEM), widening participation and small and specialist institutions http://www.hefce.ac.uk/media/hefce/content/news/news/2014/grantletter/grant_letter_2014.pdf

[17] See Cultural Learning Alliance brief p3-4 for statistics relating to disadvantaged children and outside of school arts provision

[18] Creative and Cultural Skills (CCS) research into the pathways into a career in Design noted the increased prevalence of unpaid Internships as part of the route into the design sector (Creative and Cultural Skills, November 2013, p6). The trend is fairly consistent across the sector, with Ideastap research finding that 91% of respondents had worked for free at some point (http://www.ideastap.com/ideasmag/all-articles/the-great-pay-debate-in-the-arts). Siebert and Wilson (2013) draw on a data from Skillset in 2008 that showed the numbers of young people undertaking internships have increased from 38 to 45 % (Siebert & Wilson, 2013, p712) There are significant incentives for young people to undertake internships: Most HEI either

formally or informally expect students to complete work placements as a key part of their education and  graduates who have completed internships are three times more likely to get a job offer than those with no work experience (Allen *et al.*, 2012; Ashton & Noonan, 2013, p89; Social mobility and child poverty commission, 2013, p4-5). However as "90 % of placements are unpaid in professions such as journalism" (Social mobility and child poverty commission, 2013, p4-5) the prevalence of internships as a route into the sector has cost implications which are especially significant as the length of internships expands to between six and eighteen months (Siebert & Wilson, 2013).  Given that the main motivation for undertaking unpaid work is a paid position at the end of it, it is important to note that survey data gathered by Siebert and Wilson (2013) showed that only 45% actually did (p715) and the Ideastap survey found that only 28% of respondents noted that working for free had directly led to paid work.  Those from underprivileged backgrounds risk being excluded from this gateway into the sector by not having the financial backing to work for free and also often lacking the social connections to gain the internships (Siebert & Wilson, 2013, p716).  Thus there is the danger of unpaid internships reproducing race, class and gender inequalities (Ashton & Noonan, 2013) (See also Creative and Cultural Skills Brief section 3 & 5 and Creatove Skillset Brief p3).  Paid internships and schemes such as the Creative Employment Programme and Building a Creative Nation go some way to reducing this potential inequality to accessing the sector (See Creative and Cultural Skills Brief section 7 and 8.)However, there is evidence to suggest that the project by project structure of the industry creates an often precarious career with little or no geographical and economic stability, no sick pay/maternity pay and long hours.  32% of UK creative industry professionals are freelancers or self-employed, rising to 90% in some sub-sectors, compared to 14% across all other sectors (Creative Skillset brief p1-2) These working conditions can disadvantage those without personal wealth as well as women, disabled people and those from BAME backgrounds (Faggian *et al.*, 2012; Comunian *et al.*, 2011; Ashton & Noonan, 2013; Eikhof & Warhurst, 2013; Morgan & Wood, 2013; Lee, 2013; Trotter, 2014, p3)

[19] "Research [Casting Call Pro] revealed that of the 1,700 respondents, 46% made less than £1,000 last year from acting jobs and 30% earned between £1,000 and £5,000. Just 2% earned £20,000 or more. The investigation, which included respondents who were mainly based in London (57%) and the south-east (14%), found that nearly a fifth failed to secure any paid acting jobs in 2013. Just over 60% worked on between one and five jobs paying at least the national minimum wage. Nearly 70% took up to five low or no pay jobs in the year, with 14% working on more than six. Almost two-thirds of actors taking part in the survey said that their acting work only represented up to a quarter of their total income for the year. However, while

many said they took other work to supplement their acting wages, 16% said they had taken no extra jobs in 2013." http://www.thestage.co.uk/news/2014/05/75-actors-earn-less-5k-per-year-survey/

[20] This was also the conclusion of a report prepared in 2007 by the Creative Industries Research and Consultancy Unit at the University of Hertfordshire for the European Social fund entitled *Creating Difference – Overcoming Barriers to Diversity in UK Film and Television Employment* (Randle et al 2007), which observes: 'The most significant finding of this research is that an emphasis on the individual demographics of diversity (for example, ethnicity, age, disability or gender), which are frequently the focus of the initiatives, may be missing a bigger picture. Often absent from the diversity agenda is the question of social class' (p. 9). A concerted strategy to address this evidence gap (which is further outlined in Appendix 7) is therefore badly needed

# Bibliography

Allen, K., Quinn, J., Hollingworth, S. & Rose, A. (2012) Becoming employable students and 'ideal' creative workers: exclusion and inequality in higher education work placements. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 34 (3): 431-452.

Anderson, M., Carroll, J. & Cameron, D. (2009) *Drama education with digital technology*. London: Continuum.

Appignanesi, R. ed. (2010) *Beyond Cultural Diversity, The case for creativity: A Third Text report*. London: Third Text Publications.

Ashton, D. & Noonan, C. (2013) Cultural work and higher education. [online] Basingstoke,: Palgrave Macmillan,. Available from: http://0-www.palgraveconnect.com.pugwash.lib.warwick.ac.uk/doifinder/10.1057/9781137013941 Connect to Palgrave e-book (Accessed

Australia Council (2014) Arts in Daily Life: Australian Participation in the Arts.

Bamford, A. (2006) *The wow factor : global research compendium on the impact of the arts in education*. Münster ; New York: Waxmann.

Baroness Andrews, K. (2014) *Culture and Poverty: Harnessing the power of the arts, culture and heritage to promote social justice in Wales* wales.gov.uk: Welsh Government.

Barber, M., Donnelly, K. & Rizvi, S. (2012) *Oceans of innovation: The Atlantic, the Pacific, global leadership and the future of education* London: Institute for Public Policy Research (IPPR).

Belfiore, E. & Bennett, O. (2007) Determinants of Impact: Towards a Better Understanding of Encounters with the Arts. *Cultural Trends*, 16 (3): 225-275.

Bowen, M. (2014) Young Musician is a welcome reminder of our homegrown talent - and that we need to continue to nurture it. *The Guardian*

Bunting, C. (2013) *A New direction: Cultural engagement by young Londoners: an introduction to key trends, drivers and challenges* London: AND.

Carpenter, H., Papps, I., Bragg, J., Dyson, A., Harris, D., Kerr, K., Todd, L. & Laing, K. (2013) *Evaluation of Pupil Premium: Research Report* TNS BMRB, T., Centre for Equity in Education, University of Manchester &amp; Newcastle University, for DfE.

Chowdry, H., Crawford, C., Dearden, L., Goodman, A. & Vignoles, A. (2009) *Widening Participation in Higher Education: Analysis using Linked Administrative Data*. London: Institute for Fiscal Studies.

Comunian, R., Faggian, A. & Jewell, S. (2011) Winning and losing in the creative industries: an analysis of creative graduates' career opportunities across creative disciplines. *Cultural Trends*, 20 (3-4): 291-308.

Creative & Cultural Skills (2012), *Impact and Footprint* 2012/13

Creative and Cultural Skills (November 2013) *Pathways to Design: Young People's Entry to the Design Sector* www.ccskills.org.uk: Creative and Cultural Skills.

Cultural Learning Alliance (2013) *Arts GCSE Entries Research*.

Department for Education. (2011) *The importance of music: a national plan for music education*. www.gov.uk/government/publications:

Department for Education. (2013) *Cultural Education: A summary of programmes and opportunities* www.gov.uk/government/publications.: Department for Culture Media and Sport,.

Eikhof, D. R. & Warhurst, C. (2013) The promised land? Why social inequalities are systemic in the creative industries. *Employee relations*, 35 (5): 495-508.

Ewing, R. (2010) *The arts and Australian Education: realising potential*. (ACER), A. C. f. E. R.

Farthing, R. (2013) *The Costs of Going to School, from Young People's Perspectives.* London: Child Poverty Action Group.

Fiske, E. B. e. (1999) *Champions of Change: The impact of the arts on learning*. Washington: The Arts Education Partnership & The President's Committee on the Arts and the Humanities.

Forgeard, M., Winner, E., Norton, A. & Schlaug, G. (2008) Practicing a musical instrument in childhood is associated with enhanced verbal ability and nonverbal reasoning. *PLoS ONE*, 3 (10):

Greevy, H., Knox, A., Nunney, F. & Pye, J. (2012) *Revised: The effects of the English Baccalaureate* Ipsos Mori & DfE.

HEFCE (2013) *Higher Education in England 2014: Key Facts*. Higher Education Funding Council for England.

Henley, D. (2011) *Music Education in England A review for the DfE and the DCMS*. http://publications.education.gov.uk/.

Henley, D. (2012) *Cultural Education in England: An independent review*. https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/cultural-education-in-england: DCMS.

Ipsos MORI (2009) *Evaluation of the Find Your Talent programme: Baseline quantitative findings from ten Find Your Talent pathfinder programmes* DCMS.

Jancovich, L. (2011) Great art for everyone? Engagement and participation policy in the arts. *Cultural Trends*, 20 (3-4): 271-279.

Jowell, T. (2004) *Government and the value of culture*.

Kowalewski, M. (2013) Opinion formers and public split on arts funding.

Lee, D. (2013) Creative Networks and Social Capital. *Cultural Work and Higher Education*, (9): 19.

Leroux, K. & Bernadska, A. (2014) Impact of the Arts on Individual Contributions to US Civil Society. *Journal of Civil Society*, 1-21.

Lindley, R., Behle, H. & Li, Y. (2009) *Dance and Drama Awards: Strategic Review 2009: Graduate Destinations for the Performing Arts: Higher Education*. Warwick Institute for Emplyment Research & Cedar.

Lord, P., Dawson, A., Featherston, G. & Sharp, C. (2012) *London Schools Research: Cultural Engagement: Report for A New Direction*. Slough: NFER.

Moreno, S., Bialystok, E., Raluca, B., Schellenberg, G. E., Cepeda, N. J. & Chau, T. (2011) Short-term *music* training enhances verbal intelligence and executive function. *Psychological Science*, 22: 1425 - 1433.

Morgan, G. & Wood, J. (2013) Creative Accommodations. *Journal of Cultural Economy*, 7 (1): 64-78.

Nathan, S. (2011) *Skills for the creative industries: Investing in the talents of our people* www.cbi.org.uk: CBI.

NESTA (2013) *A Manifesto for the Creative Economy*

Newbigin, J. (2011) A golden age for the arts? *Cultural Trends*, 20 (3-4): 231-234.

Nussbaum, M. C. (2010) *Not for profit : why democracy needs the humanities*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press.

Oakley, K. (2011) In its own image: New Labour and the cultural workforce. *Cultural Trends*, 20 (3-4): 281-289.

OECD (2014) *PISA 2012 Results: Creative Problem Solving: Students' Skills in Tackling Real-Life Problems (Volume V)*. PISA & OECD Publishing.

Pomegranate & TBR. (2014) *Studying Craft: trends in craft education and training summary report*. London: Council, C.

President's Committee on the Arts and the Humanities (2011) *Reinvesting in Arts Education: Winning America's Future Through Creative Schools* Washington DC:

Randle, K. R., Kurian, J. and Leung, W. F. (2007) *Creating difference: overcoming barriers to diversity in UK film and television employment*, Creative Industries Research & Consultancy Unit, Business School, University of Hertfordshire .

Rauscher, F. H. & Zuppan, M. A. (2000) Classroom keyboard instruction improves kindergarten children's spatial-temporal performance: A field experiment. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly*, 15 (2): 215-228.

Roberts, P. (2006) *Nurturing Creativity in Young People A report to Government to inform future policy* DCMS

Schellenberg, E. G. (2006) Long-term positive associations between music lessons and IQ. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, 98 (2): 457-468.

Shook, A., Marian, V., Bartolotti, j. & Schroeder, S. R. (2013) Musical Experience Influences Statistical Learning of a Novel Language *The American Journal of Psychology*, 126 (1): 95-104

Siebert, S. & Wilson, F. (2013) All work and no pay: consequences of unpaid work in the creative industries. *Work, Employment & Society* 27 711-721.

Smith, D. (2013) *An independent report for the Welsh Government into Arts in Education in the Schools of Wales* wales.gov.uk: Welsh Government.

Social mobility and child poverty commission (2013) *State of the nation 2013: social mobility and child poverty in Great Britain*. Social mobility and child poverty commission.

Tripney, J., Newman, M., Bird, K., Vigurs, C., Kaira, N., Kwan, I. & Bangpan, M. (2010) Understanding the impact of engagement in culture and sport. London: case.

White, J. (2007) Wellbeing and Education: Issues of Culture and Authority. *Journal of Philosophy of Education*, 41 (1): 17-28.

Winston, J. (2006) Beauty, goodness and education: the Arts beyond utility. *Journal of Moral Education*, 35 (3): 285-300.

# Appendices

## Appendix 1

### 2011 CBI report Skills for the creative industries: Investing in the talents of our people

"[...] the view from many of the creative sub-sectors is that the UK is now slipping on this measure and risks being overtaken by global competitors." (Nathan, 2011, p1)

The four areas to address:

- ⮑ Tackling the UK's long-tail of underachievement on basic skills
- ⮑ Developing a strong base of STEM skills
- ⮑ Ensuring young people can study a range of creative subjects
- ⮑ Business supporting educational delivery. (Nathan, 2011, p4)

Summary of main recommendations:

To ensure the UK creative industries sector has the skills it needs to maintain and grow its international position, and to drive private sector growth and employment, action is urgently needed.

This brief makes a number of recommendations at each stage of the learning journey – schools, higher education and workforce development.

*Ensuring young people leave school with a strong grasp of the basics*

- ⮑ The Department for Education to ensure that all young people continue studying maths post-16 at a level appropriate to them
- ⮑ The Department for Education to introduce an automatic opt-in to triple science GCSE for the most able pupils
- ⮑ The Department for Education to include a creative subject within the specification of the English Baccalaureate
- ⮑ The Department for Education and employers must promote best practice on business-school collaboration e.g. by further supporting the work of the Education and Employers Taskforce.

*Developing up-to-date knowledge and skills through university programmes*

- ⮑ Universities and business need to collaborate more closely on course development, with both investing time and resources into developing relationships.
- ⮑ Supporting employers to develop the abilities of the current workforce
- ⮑ Within the Department for Business, Innovation and Skills' budget for supporting SME training, there should be a focus on promoting collaboration between SMEs in close geographical proximity
- ⮑ The Department for Business, Innovation and Skills to promote ATAs and other collaborative apprenticeship models – including large firms willing to over-train apprentices for firms in the sector
- ⮑ Skillset to continue promoting their internship guidance to spread best practice within the industry

➲ The Department for Business, Innovation and Skills to introduce no new legislation extending the national minimum wage to cover all internships."(Nathan, 2011, p11)

## Appendix 2

### Demographic data 1

| Sector | % BAME | % Women |
|---|---|---|
| **Craft** | 5.6 | 29.4 |
| **Cultural Heritage** | 5.7 | 59.9 |
| **Design** | 5.5 | 33.2 |
| **Literature** | 5.3 | 50.6 |
| **Music** | 4.3 | 32.2 |
| **Performing Arts** | 9.3 | 43.9 |
| **Visual Arts** | 4.9 | 53.7 |
| **Footprint** | **6.1** | **39.4** |

Source: Creative & Cultural Skills, Impact and Footprint 2012/13, (2012)

### Demographic data 2

| Sector | 2012 | Women (%) | BAME (%) | Disabled (%) |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| *TV* | 50,605 | 45% | 8% | 4% |
| *VFX* | 5,300 | 19% | 1% | |
| *Film* | 30,125 | 46% | 6% | 6% |
| *Games* | 5,475 | 14% | 5% | 7% |
| *Advertising* | 103,625 | 46% | 9% | 11% |
| *Other (Animation, Interactive Media etc)* | 152,060 | 35% | 5% | 7% |
| *Fashion & Textiles* | 318,635 | 49% | 17% | 16% |
| *Publishing* | 192,355 | 44% | 9% | 14% |
| **Total** | 858,185 | 45% | 11% | 12% |
| **Whole Economy** | 29,600,000 | 46% | 10% | 15% |

Source: Creative Skillset Brief p3

© 2014

## Appendix 3

### *Lisbon Key Competencies*

The Lisbon Key Competencies for life-long learning were developed in response to Recommendation 2006/962/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council of 18 December 2006 on key competences for lifelong learning [Official Journal L 394 of 30.12.2006]. They are a combination of knowledge, skills and attitudes appropriate to the context. They are particularly necessary for personal fulfilment and development, social inclusion, active citizenship and employment.- The eight competencies are: **Communication in the mother tongue** and communication in foreign languages, Mathematical competence and basic competences in science and technology, Digital competence, **Learning to learn**, **Social and civic competence**, **Sense of initiative and entrepreneurship**, **Cultural awareness and expression**. The DICE Consortium research showed that Drama and Theatre Education improved the five highlighted competencies along with the additional competency "All this and more"

## Appendix 4

### *Department for Education Cultural Provision*

In 2013 DfE outlined their ambitions for cultural education in the UK (Department for Education, 2013, p13):

#### Ambitions for world-class cultural education

1. Cultural opportunities for all pupils
2. Nurturing talent and targeting disadvantage
3. A high-quality curriculum and qualifications offer in arts subjects
4. Excellent teaching
5. Celebrating national culture and history
6. Creating a lasting network of partnerships to deliver our ambitions, now and for the future. (Department for Education, 2013, p8)

#### Key cultural initiatives the government are developing or sustaining with partners:

- Music education hubs
- In Harmony
- The Music and Dance Scheme
- Museums and Schools Programme
- National Youth Dance Company
- The Sorrell Foundation's National Art and Design Saturday Clubs
- Cultural Passport
- Heritage Schools
- BFI Film Academy
- National Youth Music Organisations (NYMOs)
- Music for Youth (MFY)
- The Shakespeare Schools Festival and RSC Shakespeare Toolkit for Teachers
- Poetry By Heart – a National Poetry Recitation Competition

*The Pupil Premium*

The pupil premium is additional funding given to publicly funded schools in England to raise the attainment of disadvantaged pupils and close the gap between them and their peers. In the 2013 to 2014 financial year, schools received: £953 for each eligible primary-aged pupil/£900 for each eligible secondary-aged pupil ([https://www.gov.uk/pupil-premium-information-for-schools-and-alternative-provision-settings](https://www.gov.uk/pupil-premium-information-for-schools-and-alternative-provision-settings))

A 2013 A.N.D (A New Direction are a ACE funded Bridge organisation based in London, responsible for connecting children, young people and education with the best of arts and culture) report on the significant changes in the English education system identified the potential for the Pupil Premium to be used to fund cultural provision, but equally schools are responsible for the impact of the spending and thus may be cautious in their choice of how to spend it. Data gathered so far on the way schools are spending the Pupil Premium shows that high percentage are choosing to spend some of it on 'Out of Hours activities' also known as 'enrichment beyond the curriculum' which can include breakfast clubs, after school and holiday clubs, homework clubs, creative play possibilities, sports, arts and leisure activities and trips not directly linked to the curriculum:

- ➲ Primary schools – 87%
- ➲ Secondary – 92%
- ➲ Special Schools – 86%
- ➲ PRU's - 71% (Carpenter *et al.*, 2013)

The questionnaire's did not break the type of enrichment activity down but some schools volunteered the information that they provided drama and music opportunities – 10% of special schools, 7% of primary schools, 5% of secondary schools, and 2% of PRUs).  The amounts spent vary considerably with Special Schools spending £462 per pupil on enrichment activities in 2012/13 whereas primary and secondary spent £21 and £37 respectively.  In all cases the highest spend was on 'Learning in the curriculum', with Special schools spending £2,716, Primary schools £269 and secondary £226 per pupil (Carpenter *et al.*, 2013).

*Note: Learning in the curriculum' is defined as – actions that are intended to affect directly performance in the classroom. They may include: one-to-one tuition; small-group teaching; additional in-class support; homework clubs; special arrangements for monitoring progress; reduced class sizes; teaching assistants; peer tutoring/peer-assisted learning; provision of materials/equipment; Reading Recovery; support for EAL. They may also include items available to all pupils but for which a financial contribution is usually requested such as: trips linked with the curriculum; visits to school by theatre companies; residential courses.*

See the Education Endowment Foundation Toolkit for the potential impact of the different pupil premium spend options [http://educationendowmentfoundation.org.uk/toolkit/](http://educationendowmentfoundation.org.uk/toolkit/)


*Example schemes and bursaries*


Arts Award                                      [http://www.artsaward.org.uk/](http://www.artsaward.org.uk/)

© 2014

BBC Performing Arts Fund          http://www.bbc.co.uk/performingartsfund/aboutus

Drama and Dance Awards          https://www.gov.uk/dance-drama-awards

Arts Fundraising &

Philanthropy Programme          http://artsfundraising.org.uk/

Creative Employment Programme:

http://ccskills.org.uk/supporters/funding/details/the-creative-employment-programme

Skills Investment Fund:

http://creativeskillset.org/who_we_help/creative_businesses/skills_investment_fund


*Example organisations linking people with cultural education*


Creative and Cultural Skills          http://ccskills.org.uk/

Cultural Learning Alliance          http://www.culturallearningalliance.org.uk/

Creative Skillset          http://creativeskillset.org/

The Council for Dance Education

& Training (CDET)          http://www.cdet.org.uk/about-us

What Next          http://www.whatnextculture.co.uk/

Creative Diversity Network          http://creativediversitynetwork.com/


*Examples of NOS, Qualifications and Apprenticeship Frameworks that have been developed by CCSkills/CSkillset specifically to address skills development needs for the creative industries.*

- Pearson Edexcel Level 3 Diploma in Community Arts Administration
- City & Guilds Level 3 Diploma in Blacksmithing
- Pearson EDI Level 3 Diploma in Cultural Heritage
- SQA Level 2 Diploma in Jewellery Manufacturing
- AIM Awards Level 3 Diploma in Enamelling
- C&G Level 3 NVQ Diploma in Sound Recording, Engineering and Studio Facilities

*Examples of Occupational and Vocational qualifications which are valued within the sector and/or have been developed in partnership between awarding bodies, employers and the SSC.*

- RSL Level 1 Certificate in Technology for Music Practitioners
- C&G Level 4 Award in Using Copyright Law to Protect Creativity and Innovation in Craft

➲ Pearson EDI Level 3 Certificate in Principles of the Creative and Cultural Sector

*Examples of Apprenticeship Frameworks*
➲ Live Events & Promotion
➲ Cultural Heritage & Venue operations
➲ Design
➲ The Skills funding agency has just announced an employer toolkit for employers that want to develop a more inclusive and accessible Apprenticeship offer http://www.employer-toolkit.org.uk/
➲ Also see Creative and Cultural Skills brief section 4

*Examples of HE Performing Arts Courses as Defined by JACS Codes*

| Area | JACS |
|---|---|
| Dance | (W500) Dance |
| | (W510) Choreography |
| | (W590) Dance not elsewhere classified |
| Drama | (W400) Drama |
| | (W410) Acting |
| | (W420) Directing for theatre |
| | (W430) Producing for theatre |
| | (W440) Theatre studies |
| | (W490) Drama not elsewhere classified |
| Music | (W300) Music |
| | (W310) Musicianship/performance studies |
| Stage Management | (W450) Stage management |
| | (W452) Theatrical make-up |
| | (W460) Theatre design |

(Lindley *et al.*, 2009)

## Appendix 5

*Costs of private tuition*

The 2009 the Dance and Drama Awards Review looked at the costs associated with private cultural tuition. It is reasonable to assume these costs will have increased over the last five years:

➲ Average cost of music lessons in maintained schools: £123 p.a.
➲ % of primary pupils in maintained schools learning instruments: 8%
➲ Average cost of boarding place at elite music or ballet school: £22,000 p.a.
➲ Average cost of training at vocational dance or drama school: £11,500 p.a.
➲ Average cost for Stagecoach: £855 p.a.

## Appendix 6

### Bridge Organisations

As part of their mission, 'achieving great art for everyone', Arts Council England has a goal to make sure that every child and young person has the opportunity to experience the richness of the arts and culture.

To help them achieve this they fund a network of 10 'bridge' organisations (as part of the National portfolio) that will use their experience and expertise to connect children and young people, schools and communities with art and culture. They will connect schools and communities with other National portfolio organisations and others in the cultural sector, including museums and libraries.

The bridge organisations and the funding they will receive to deliver this work from 2012-15

| Area | Organisation | Funding |
|------|-------------|---------|
| East | Norfolk and Norwich | £500,000 |
|  | Royal Opera House | £730,000 |
| East Midlands | Mighty Creatives | £900,000 |
| London | A New Direction | £1,100,000 |
|  | working with four 'associate bridge organisations': |  |
|  | Sadler's Wells | £75,000 |
|  | Roundhouse | £160,000 |
|  | Apples and Snakes | £55,000 |
|  | Lyric Hammersmith | £160,000 |
| North East | The Sage Gateshead | £483,000 |
| North West | Curious Minds | £1,351,000 |
| South East | Artswork | £1,526,000 |
| South West | RIO | £880,000 |
| West Midlands | Arts Connect | £1,124,000 |
| Yorkshire | Cape UK | £1,018,000 |

http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/what-we-do/our-priorities-2011-15/children-and-young-people/bridge-organisations/#sthash.aealBFrX.dpuf

© 2014

## *Arts mark*

Artsmark is Arts Council England's flagship programme to enable schools and other organisations to evaluate, strengthen and celebrate their arts and cultural provision. Artsmark is delivered by Trinity College London and 10 regional Bridge organisations drive participation. They are supported by the Department for Education, the Department for Culture, Media and Sport, the Office for Standards in Education (Ofsted) and a number of other partners.

Artsmark also award 'Good Practice Centres' who demonstrate exceptional arts provision, clear vision and strategy for the arts within their organisation, opportunities for young people and staff to continually develop in the arts, ands strong partnerships with arts and cultural organisations. These centres then share their expertise with other organisations

### Artsmark Good Practice Centres 2014/15:

**East**
Sawston Village College

**East Midlands**
Clayfields House Secure Children's Home
Redmoor Academy

**London**
Chingford Foundation School
Parliament Hill School

**North East**
Rockcliffe First School

**North West**
Kelsall Primary School

**South East**
Helenswood Academy

**South West**
Damers First School
Isambard Community School
The Mead Community Primary School

**West Midlands**
Hillstone Primary School
Whitgreave Primary School

**Yorkshire**
Hoyland Common Primary School


http://www.artsmark.org.uk/

*Gaps in Evidence*

- ➲ More research is needed on the reasons behind lack of diversity (women and BAME) in the sector which will require in depth interviewing and longitudinal ethnographic fieldwork

- ➲ There is a need for research which captures data on the socio-economic background of those entering the sector. One reason for the lack of data on this is that it is very difficult to cover Socio Economic Status in one question within a questionnaire. Some example questions would be:
    - Did any of your parent(s) or guardian(s) complete a university degree course or equivalent (for example BA, BSc or higher)?
    - Which of the groups represents your and your husband/wife/partner's) income from all these sources before any deductions for income tax, National Insurance, etc.?
    - What type of school did you mainly attend between the ages of 11 and 16?
    - At any point during your school years, did your household receive income support?
    - At any point during your school years, did you receive free school meals?
    - What was the postcode of the house you grew up in?

- ➲ The UK does collect cohort data which could be mined for information

- ➲ There are no longitudinal studies which trace the career paths followed by apprentices over time.

- ➲ Although it is clear that internships have grown significantly in recent years, there is as yet no evidence which captures the full extent of the practice in the creative industries.

See Creative Skillset brief p5, Creative and Cultural Skills section 9 and Cultural Learning Alliance Brief p5